

### Bibliographic Information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Centeno, Vera G., author.

Title: The OECD's educational agendas : framed from above, fed from below, determined in an interaction : a study on the recurrent education agenda / Vera G. Centeno.

Description: Frankfurt am Main ; New York : Peter Lang GmbH, internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften, [2017] | Series: Komparatistische Bibliothek, ISSN 0934-0858 ; vol. 28

Identifiers: LCCN 2017045324 | ISBN 9783631717721 (print) | ISBN 9783631739730 (e-PDF) | ISBN 9783631739747 (ePUB) | ISBN 9783631739754 (MOBI)

Subjects: LCSH: Adult education and state--OECD countries. | Continuing education--OECD countries. | Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.

Classification: LCC LC5225.A36 C46 2017 | DDC 374--dc23 LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017045324>

This book is a doctoral thesis written at Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences. The doctoral research was supported by the Portuguese Foundation for Research and Technology (FCT) under grant SFRH/BD/27356/2006 (QREN-POPH European programme). The publication was supported by the University of Tampere, Faculty of Education.

Printed by CPI books GmbH, Leck.

ISSN 0934-0858	ISBN 978-3-631-71772-1 (Print)
E-ISBN 978-3-631-71773-0 (E-PDF)	E-ISBN 978-3-631-71774-7 (EPUB)
E-ISBN 978-3-631-71775-4 (MOBI)	DOI 10.3726/b12774

© Peter Lang GmbH  
Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften  
Berlin 2017  
All rights reserved.

Peter Lang - Berlin · Bern · Bruxelles · New York ·  
Oxford · Warszawa · Wien

All parts of this publication are protected by copyright. Any utilisation outside the strict limits of the copyright law, without the permission of the publisher, is forbidden and liable to prosecution. This applies in particular to reproductions, translations, microfilming, and storage and processing in electronic retrieval systems.

This publication has been peer reviewed.

[www.peterlang.com](http://www.peterlang.com)

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgements .....15

Abbreviations and Acronyms .....19

List of Boxes, Figures and Tables .....21

1. Elaboration of the OECD's Educational Agendas .....23

1.1 The OECD: Major Provider of International Knowledge and Complex IGO .....27

1.2 Three Interlocking Propositions for the Understanding of Agenda-Setting and Knowledge Production within the OECD .....32

1.2.1 Framed from Above ..... 33

1.2.2 Fed from Below ..... 36

1.2.3 Determined in Interaction ..... 40

1.3 RE: The OECD's First Educational Agenda .....41

1.3.1 Origin, Development and Content ..... 42

1.3.2 Common Misconceptions ..... 46

1.3.3 The Impact and Success of the OECD's RE Agenda ..... 51

1.4 Navigating through the Maze of Papers: Sources and Methods .....54

1.4.1 Contextualizing: An In-House Directed Perspective ..... 55

1.4.2 Preparation: Ongoing Data Collection and Open Analysis ..... 58

1.4.3 Map: The OECD's Internal Documents and the Complementary Sources ..... 62

1.4.4 Route: Iterative and Interactive Analyses ..... 67

1.5 Layers and Structure of the Book .....69

1.5.1 Three Layers ..... 69

1.5.2 Seven Chapters ..... 71

<b>2. Looking into the ‘Black Box’: Exploring Agenda-Setting and Knowledge Production</b> .....	75
2.1 Building Up: Educational Research and Initial Suggestions on the OECD’s Complexity.....	77
2.2 Dimension 1: Actor – Capabilities for Autonomy and Influence.....	84
2.2.1 The OECD Secretariat.....	85
2.2.2 The OECD’s Profile and Working Methods.....	86
2.2.3 The OECD’s Multilateral Analyses.....	87
2.3 Dimension 2: Arena – Dynamics and Institutional Specificities.....	88
2.3.1 The OECD as an Intergovernmental Place.....	89
2.3.2 The OECD as an Institutional Setting.....	92
2.4 Dimension 3: Instrument – Out-of-House Constellations and Motivations.....	98
2.4.1 The OECD as an Interactive and Reactive Player.....	98
2.4.2 The OECD as an Instrumental Player.....	99
2.5 Zooming In: The Institutional, Conceptual and Policy Changes behind the Organizational Relocations of the Education Section.....	101
2.5.1 International Changes, Internal Conditions and Institutional Challenges.....	105
2.5.2 Repositioning Education: Illustration 1 – From Science to Social Affairs and Manpower.....	111
2.5.3 Unexpected Conflicts – Illustration 2: From Educational to Social Activities?.....	114
2.6 Magnifying: The Actors within the Actor, their Functional and Organizational Relationships.....	120
2.6.1 The Relationship between the Secretariat and the CSTP/EDC.....	121
2.6.2 The Relationship between the CTPS/EDC and the CERI.....	122
2.6.3 The Relationship between the CERI-GB and the Secretariat.....	122

2.6.4 The Relationship between the Secretariat and the OECD experts.....	123
2.6.5 The Relationship between the Secretariat and the SG.....	123
2.7 Backstage: The Production of Documents in the Education Section.....	124
2.7.1 Policy Papers under the Auspices of the Educational Committee: Easy-to-Frame Problems, Difficult-to-Frame Solutions.....	125
2.7.1.1 How Did the Secretariat Write the Papers?.....	126
2.7.1.2 What Alterations Did the Secretariat Make as a Result of Criticism from the CSTP?.....	127
2.7.1.3 How did the CSTP/EDC Directly Revise the Papers? In the End, Who Decides What under the CSTP/EDC?.....	130
2.7.2 Ideational Changes under the Auspices of the CERI: The Free Zone.....	132
2.7.2.1 The ‘Legitimation Loop’: Legitimizing Projects through the Institutional Web.....	132
2.7.2.2 Pushing Unwelcome Projects: The Role of ‘Feasibility Work’.....	134
2.7.2.3 Framing ‘Institutional Subjectivity’: The Uniqueness of the CERI within the OECD, and of the OECD in the International Arena.....	135
2.7.2.4 Compromise, Concession, Compliance.....	139
2.8 Conclusion: The OECD’s Three Overlapping Constitutive Dimensions and the Importance of Intertwined Institutional and Conceptual Changes.....	140
<b>3. The Emergence of RE within the OECD</b> .....	145
3.1 From a Single to a Twin Structure: The CERI and the Reform of the Education Section.....	147
3.1.1 The Creation of the CERI: Overcoming the Shortcomings of the Official Committee.....	149
3.1.2 Unexpected Institutional Dynamics, Struggles and Strategies: The Rise of a Policy Committee.....	153

3.1.3	The CERI at the Council's Table: Cross-National Divergences and Convergences .....	157
3.1.4	A Renewed Education Section: Fundamental Changes, New Arrangements, Old Tensions .....	161
3.2	From Educational Expansion to Alternative Futures: RE and the Reform of the Educational System.....	163
3.2.1	The Big Picture: The Swedish and the OECD's Synergetic Agendas.....	166
3.2.2	Educational Expansion and Equality of Educational Opportunity: What Are the Problems and the Solutions Addressed? .....	173
3.2.3	From Democratization and Modernization to Alternative Futures: The Changing Programme of the CERI .....	182
3.2.3.1	The Initial Programme: A Compromise between Social and Economic Issues or Between Internal and External Views? .....	182
3.2.3.2	The Programme Put into Practice: Work and Dynamics Go by the Book.....	184
3.2.3.3	A Sudden Shift: A Programme at the Mercy of its Institutional Environment? .....	187
3.2.4	RE: The Total System Reform Approach.....	190
3.3	Conclusion: Interlinking In-House and Out-of-House Ideas and Interests.....	195
<b>4.</b>	<b>The Crystallization of the RE Idea .....</b>	<b>205</b>
4.1	Deciphering the Reform Idea.....	207
4.1.1	What Was RE Not About?.....	208
4.1.2	Acting on SE Targeting Changes in Casual Domains? .....	211
4.1.2.1	Interpretive Frame: The Equality of Educational Opportunity Principle.....	211
4.1.2.2	Proposals: The Interplay between Formal Education and Work, and the Credit System .....	216
4.2	Imagining the OECD's Educational Action.....	218

4.2.1	Different Semantic Resources, Different Solutions, Same Reform Idea.....	222
4.2.2	Different Structural Problems, Different Interests, Same Technical Resource.....	227
4.3	The Strategy Group and the Feasibility Study on Recurrent Education.....	231
4.3.1	Setting a Strategy Group, Legitimizing RE.....	232
4.3.2	RE as AE or SE? Both? Neither?.....	234
4.3.3	The 'Feasibility Study': Concretization under Cooperation .....	240
4.4	The OECD's First Stance on Education: The RE Idea Enters into the International Debate.....	242
4.4.1	The 1970 Conference on Policies for Educational Growth .....	244
4.4.2	The 1970 International Year of Education and the International Educational Scene.....	245
4.4.3	The First Report on RE .....	250
4.5	Conclusion: Assembling Existing Work, Embodying the New Horizontal Approach, 'Stirring Up' Domestic Interest, Establishing Interpretations .....	253
<b>5.</b>	<b>The Formulation of the RE Policy Idea .....</b>	<b>261</b>
5.1	The Need for a 'Clean Conception' .....	263
5.1.1	Divergences within the Organizational Consensus... ..	264
5.1.2	... the Echo of External Understandings? .....	269
5.2	Merging 'Theorization' and Diffusion: The Adopter Becomes the Author and the Providers Become the Adopters.....	273
5.2.1	Reframing Existing Practices: How do Plural Programmes Become RE Provisions? .....	276
5.2.1.1	The Feasibility Studies: Intentions and Accomplishments .....	276
5.2.1.2	Information, Inspirations and Interests.....	278
5.2.1.3	The Conceptualization of Situated Practices and Processes.....	282
5.2.2	Framing Adopters: How do Lenders Become Borrowers? .....	284

5.2.2.1	A 'Legitimated Collective Theorization'.....	285
5.2.2.2	The CERI/OECD 'Country Studies'.....	286
5.3	The OECD's First Education Policy: The Interesting but Unaccepted RE Policy .....	291
5.3.1	From Feasibility to the Policy Implications: Clarification, Contestation, <b>Compatibility</b> .....	293
5.3.2	1973: The (Symbolic) International Year of RE.....	298
5.3.3	The Clarifying Report on RE.....	303
5.4	Conclusion: Positioning the CERI, Responding to Internal-External Imperatives, Appropriating Domestic Developments, Creating Placeless Views .....	308
<b>6.</b>	<b>The Realization, Reformulation and Renouncement of the RE Frame .....</b>	<b>317</b>
6.1	The OECD's First Political Apogee in Education.....	318
6.1.1	Educational Priorities: the tacit agreement on RE.....	320
6.1.2	Institutional Priorities: RE within the Wider Picture.....	322
6.1.3	International Priorities: The 1975 Policy Report and Conference .....	326
6.2	The OECD's (First) Political Retraction.....	329
6.2.1	Institutional Patterns: Crisis Equals Organizational Relinquishment and Multilateral Empowerment.....	331
6.2.1.1	New Organizational Arrangements: The Review of the OECD's Activities .....	332
6.2.1.2	Similar Dynamics across Time: Tensions and Contestation .....	333
6.2.1.3	Decisions at the OECD Council's Table: The Finances of the OECD's Activities .....	335
6.2.1.4	Changing Geometries of Action: The Empowerment of the Institutional Bodies .....	336
6.2.2	Conceptual Readjustments: Refocusing on Applicable Ideas.....	339
6.2.2.1	From 'Alternative Futures' to 'Innovation Themes': The Ongoing Changing Programme of the CERI.....	339

6.2.2.2	Reimagining the OECD's Educational Action .....	341
6.2.3	International Standby: Refraining from Publications.....	344
6.2.3.1	The Implementation Actions: Intentions and Accomplishments.....	345
6.2.3.2	The Unmanageable Collective Practice and the Unpublished 1977 Conference Proceedings .....	347
6.2.3.2	The Unpublished 1979 Report on RE .....	350
6.3	The OECD's (First) Disenchantment in Education.....	353
6.3.1	The Piecemeal Approach: What Has RE Become About?.....	355
6.2.2.3.1	The Involvement of Countries: From Policy Abstraction to Policy Implementation .....	356
6.2.2.3.2	The Assemblage of Nationally Driven Issues under the Label of RE: From Schooling to AE.....	358
6.3.2	The Last Report on RE: Mirroring Synergetic Agendas, Internal and International Collaborations .....	360
6.3.2.1	New and Old Synergetic Agendas .....	360
6.3.2.2	Internal and International Collaborations .....	365
6.4	Conclusion: Priorities and Patterns, Re-assemblages and Re-adjustments.....	369
<b>7.</b>	<b>The Recurrent Education Agenda.....</b>	<b>375</b>
7.1	Framed from Above: An Agenda without Consequences?.....	376
7.2	Fed from Below: Self-Evidently Transnational?.....	387
7.3	Determined in Interaction: The Fruit of a Monolithic IGO?.....	392
7.4	Final Comments, New Beginnings .....	396
<b>References .....</b>		<b>403</b>
Archives .....		403
The OECD documents.....		403
Literature .....		415

<b>Appendices</b> .....	431
Appendix 1.1: The OECD member countries by year of ratification of the convention and in alphabetical order .....	431
Appendix 1.2: The OECD in Its Own Words .....	432
Appendix 1.3: List of Informal Interviews.....	432
Appendix 3.1: Relevant Actors in the OECD Education Section (1968–1970).....	433
Appendix 3.2: Relevant Actors in the OECD Education Section (1971–1974).....	434
Appendix 3.3: Conceptual Cloud Map I – Equality and Training in Secondary Education (early 1960s) .....	435
Appendix 3.4: Conceptual Cloud Map II – Recurrent Education: The Total System Reform Approach (late 1960s) .....	436
Appendix 4.1: Country Replies to the CERI Questionnaire about Current and Future Activities (1971) .....	437
Appendix 4.2: Timeline: Events and Papers (1960–70) .....	443
Appendix 6.1: RE-related Activities Across Time and Policy Levels (1961–86) .....	444

To Fabio Gorodski